

## **‘Why Bibliotherapy?’ A Content Analysis of its Uses, Impediments and Potential Applications for School Libraries**

**Christine A. Garrett Davis, MLIS\***

\* Joseph Sibilly Elementary School,  
United States Virgin Islands, Department of Education

**Abstract:** This paper is a historical examination of the use of bibliotherapy, its impediments and potential resolutions. It has been more than ninety years since Sadie Peterson Delaney, chief librarian of the United States Veterans Administration Hospital in Tuskegee, Alabama worked with a team of social workers and psychiatrists to practice bibliotherapy on World War I Veterans. Bibliotherapy is supported by the age-old ideological concept of the ‘healing power of books’ (Lehr, 1981). For decades, theoretical arguments have ensued regarding its questionable success as a treatment, the efficacy of its use and the competency of its practitioners. The primary antagonists seem to be proponents of evidence-based medicine (EBM) with meta-analysis as its statistical methodology for assessing clinical effectiveness.

In recent years, bibliotherapy has acquired some stature as a recognized therapeutic activity (Jack & Ronan, 2008). Bibliotherapy schema are appearing in schools at increasing rates as an adjunct program for students experiencing loss, victims and perpetrators of bullying, and special needs students with physical and learning disabilities. Many students enter the educational system lacking the necessary social, emotional, and academic prerequisites to be successful. Bibliotherapy is perceived as one strategy to overcome such societal impediments (Cook, Earles-Vollrath, & Banz, 2006; Iaquina & Hipsky, 2006).

In addition to its academic function, the school library is a place where children and teenagers absorb cultural values and where bibliotherapy can play a humanistic role in their social and emotional development (Jurkowski, 2006). This paper examines several proactive perspectives such as training in bibliotherapeutic practices in library science degree programs for school librarians. Rubin (1978) suggested that librarians view their



role in bibliotherapy as a possible path toward students' self-actualization (Baruchson-Arbib, 2000).

**Keywords:** Bibliotherapy, Content Analysis, School Libraries, Evidence-based Medicine, Bullying

## **1. Introduction**

This paper is written through the lens of a school librarian. School librarians provide support for learning in a safe and secure environment where children can develop socially and emotionally and are often among those persons to whom students confess losses, abuse, and fears.

There are three types of bibliotherapy: institutional, clinical, and developmental. However, this paper is primarily concerned with developmental, also referred to as educational bibliotherapy, and the developmental needs of young and adolescent students.

### **1.1 Purpose of the Study**

There is a need for an examination of studies related to bibliotherapy in school libraries and for the potential usefulness of bibliotherapy in the developmental growth of students. Schools are communities and the school library is the hub of campus life. Students within these campuses often come from diverse socio-economic and cultural backgrounds. Some of these families may not be what was once considered traditional. Parenting in some households may be from a guardian, single parent, a surrogate parent lacking official status or from biracial or same-sex parents. It is not unusual for school children to experience a loss due to death, incarceration, military service, illness, employment lay-off, marital separation or divorce. All of these losses are within the normal range of experience for children growing up in a modern society; nonetheless, support should be available so that they may learn healthy coping skills.

School librarians interact with students and teachers in both formal and informal learning settings, guiding students and teachers to materials that meet their academic needs and personal interests. Students often access the school library as independent information seekers and for comfort. As students advance from one grade level to the next, student-teacher relationships shift from one teacher to another. In contrast to grade level homeroom teachers, school librarians maintain a presence throughout a child's journey from kindergarten to the sixth grade, middle level, or senior high school as the case may be. Some of these students' normal life experiences, both at home and in school, will be milestones in their social and emotional development. Many U.S. states require that licensed school librarians have teacher training. Thus, many library professionals are familiar with the developmental needs of students. The question then becomes (1) what should the role of the librarian be in caring for the whole student and (2) how literature can play a supportive role toward students' self-development.

The purpose of this study is to examine the literature related to bibliotherapy's perceived usefulness and to inform library professionals of creative and sustainable possibilities for bibliotherapy applications.

### **1.2 Research Questions**

R1. How many (and what percentage) of papers in this study consider bibliotherapy a useful therapeutic tool?

R2. How many (and what percentage) of the papers were opposed to the use of bibliotherapy?

R3. How many (and what percentage) of papers supporting bibliotherapy indicate librarians could be beneficial to bibliotherapeutic objectives?

R4. What applications of bibliotherapy involving youth were identified in the articles?

### **1.3 Limitations of the Study**

This study is limited to articles related to developmental bibliotherapy. It is further limited to English language articles indexed in scholarly educational and LIS databases.

### **1.4 Assumptions**

It is assumed that bibliotherapeutic papers were correctly indexed in the databases and are retrievable, that databases used in this study are maintained for currency, and that search queries will consistently retrieve relevant articles in each of the databases.

### **1.5 Importance of the Study**

Many of today's youth belong to a social and domestic matrix lacking the degree of support available to previous generations. Technology's mobile and home entertainment devices have given youth access to information that may have been deemed inappropriate a generation ago. Certainly this has altered the culture of behavior and social interactions among students.

Bullying appears to occur more frequently than a generation ago. School districts have intensified disciplinary and anti-bullying policies. While there are many good positive behavior intervention programs, perhaps behavior may also be addressed through students' increased understanding of themselves and others (Gregory & Vessey, 2004).

Guided developmental reading embraces a more holistic approach to the learning needs of students. One example of a school's mission statement pledges 'to support the holistic development of its students, to enrich

children's lives through learning, encourage achievement, challenge children to think, allow them to develop creative potential, help them become responsible citizens' (Tangier Smith Elementary School, 1996).

## **2. Literature Review**

### **2.1 What is Bibliotherapy?**

There are several perspectives on the definition of bibliotherapy. Broadly speaking, bibliotherapy may be an institutional, clinical, or developmental process. School librarians are most likely to apply bibliotherapy to the normal developmental needs of students. Gavigan and Kurtts (2010) described bibliotherapy as a strategy that uses literature to help the reader cultivate empathy and an understanding of diversity. Another more descriptive definition of bibliotherapy by Katz and Watt (1992) is 'the guided use of reading, always with a therapeutic outcome in mind' (Katz & Wyatt, 1992; Jones, 2006). Perhaps the most comprehensive description of bibliotherapy comes from Kenneth B. Cronje (1994) who published seven definitions of bibliotherapy in his type and process analysis of bibliotherapy. They are as follows:

1. 'employment of books and the reading of them in the treatment of nervous disease' (*Dorland's Illustrated Medical Dictionary*, 1941; Swart, 1984).
2. 'process of interaction between the personality of the reader and imaginative literature which may engage his emotions and free them for conscious and productive uses' (Shrodes, 1949; Swart, 1984).
3. 'programme of selected activity involving reading materials, planned, conducted, and controlled as treatment ... for emotional and other problems' (Tews, 1962; Swart, 1984).
4. 'activity programme based on the assimilation of the psychological, sociological and aesthetic values of imaginative and didactic information media in the human personality and behavior' (Cilliers, 1980).
5. 'family of techniques for structuring an interaction between a facilitator and a participant ... based on their mutual sharing of literature' (Berry in Coleman & Ganong, 1988).
6. 'program of activity on the interactive processes of media and the people who experience it. Print or non-print material, either imaginative or informational is experienced and discussed with the aid of a facilitator' (Rubin, 1978).
7. 'the right book to the right child at the right time about the right problem' (Lundsteen in Cornett & Cornett, 1980). (Cronje, 1994, 121)

Janaviciene (2010) noted six other authors and their theses of bibliotherapy. While not particularly unlike the substance of Cronje's position, Cronje's language provided greater clarity about likely service providers and their respective roles. It should be noted that until the 1950s, the role of the bibliotherapist belonged solely to the physician. With the advancement of vaccines and antibiotics, long institutional treatments became less common. Librarians and their interests spurred the movement of bibliotherapy from

sanitaria to public libraries where they serviced lay audiences (Dysart-Gale, 2008). Thus, the aims of bibliotherapy were modified.

Pardeck (1993, 1994) established six potential aims for the use of bibliotherapy. These objectives are replicated in several studies by authors of varied academic disciplines:

1. To provide information.
2. To provide insight into a specific experience or situation.
3. To provide alternative solutions to the problem.
4. To stimulate a discussion of what the actual problem is.
5. To communicate new values and attitudes to the problem.
6. To help students understand that they are not the only one who has experienced this problem. (Cook, Earles-Vollrath, & Banz, 2006)

In 1949, Caroline Shrodes addressed the subject more thoroughly in her unpublished dissertation (Lehr, 1981). In 1950, the dissertation appeared in *School Review* (Russell & Shrodes, 1950). Shrodes offered a framework for the bibliotherapeutic process: identification, in which the reader associates himself or herself with a character or situation in a book; catharsis, in which the reader shares the feelings and motivations of the book's character; and insight, which takes place as the reader realizes his or her situation can be dealt with more effectively. The process is completed as the reader imitates or adapts the problem-solving ideas from the reading material (Shrodes, 1949; Russell & Shrodes, 1950; Lehr, 1981).

## **2.2 Historical Background**

Although the term bibliotherapy has a modern history, the ideological acceptance that books have healing properties is an ancient one. Salup and Salup (1981) traced bibliotherapy's holistic essence to ancient Greece. Over the door of the library at Thebes was written, 'Healing place of the soul'. In ancient Greece literature was used to treat the mentally ill (Stroud, Stroud, & Staley, 1999; Cook, Earles-Vollrath, & Banz, 2006).

The term bibliotherapy was first created and published in a 1916 edition of the *Atlantic Monthly*. Its creator was Samuel Crothers, a Unitarian minister describing a method for bringing troubled persons together with relevant books (Lehr, 1981). Initially the application of bibliotherapy was limited to hospitals; by the 1940s, it had spread to other settings. In hospitals it was used as an adjunct to library services for World War I veterans. In 1946, bibliotherapy was applied to children for the first time (Agnes, 1946; Myracle, 1995).

Today's application of bibliotherapy is somewhat different from that of the 1940's through the 1960's. Books were thought to have a powerful impact on a child's values and by reading certain materials they would develop virtuous behavior (Allen et al., 2012). In regard to juvenile delinquents, Judge Jacob Panken asserted in 1947 that almost all children want to be good, but that a poor

home life can turn a child to delinquency (Myracle, 1995). Gradually, literature took on a more realistic tone and there was a more child-focused application of bibliotherapy (Myracle, 1995).

Perhaps the most famous practitioner and advocate for bibliotherapy was Sadie Peterson Delaney, chief librarian of the United States Veterans Administration Hospital in Tuskegee, Alabama. During the early 1920s, she was part of a team of social workers treating African American war veterans. 'Their goal was to enable patients to connect, or reconnect themselves with a broad community of ideas' (Jones, 2006, 24). She received worldwide recognition and actively trained other librarians in the practice of bibliotherapy. The idea of bibliotherapy flourished in army hospitals during the 1930s and in 1939, the American Library Association established a Bibliotherapy Committee, a milestone giving bibliotherapy official status in the field of librarianship (Baruchson-Aribib, 2000).

As stated earlier, there are three (3) basic types of bibliotherapy, institutional, clinical and developmental. The identifying names and descriptive language for each type may differ somewhat, but it is apparent that developmental bibliotherapy may be related to students' emotional and social growth. The school librarians' expertise, educational training, and lengthy relationship with students are seemingly key components for maturational support.

### **2.3 Bibliotherapy and Librarianship**

'Bibliotherapy in School Libraries: An Israeli Experiment' (Baruchson-Aribib, 2000) informs readers that although school libraries are supportive environments where children readily absorb cultural values and knowledge, the concept of bibliotherapy has not been very successful in the field of librarianship. Rubin (1978) explained that the interpersonal power structure of therapy and the exalted position of medical doctors in society causes many librarians to fear any activity called therapy. Rubin advises librarians to view this work as an activity that will encourage self-actualization and further states this would not remedy the problem that students seem unaware that libraries have self-help literature to address developmental issues and support problem-solving (Baruchson-Aribib, 2000; Rubin, 1978).

Baruchson-Aribib (2000) concurred with Rubin's 1978 assessment of this dilemma. The therapeutic nature of bibliotherapy does not allow for its full application in libraries. Both authors suggest defining bibliotherapy with a new term. In Baruchson-Aribib's 2000 study involving two middle schools, bibliotherapy was termed 'supportive knowledge'. As it stands now, the term bibliotherapy addresses a very broad area of expertise that suggests medical treatment. When associated with librarianship, questions are raised regarding librarians' qualifications as medical practitioners.

Rubin (1978) hoped this problem might be avoided that by limiting the librarians' role in the developmental bibliotherapy framework – a role that may be termed *educational bibliotherapy*. Rubin points out that developmental bibliotherapy addresses typical developmental problems such as family conflicts, changes in functions related to aging, career changes and such. When developmental issues are involved, the librarian recommends books that shed light and offer insight to those problems (Baruchson-Arbib, 2000).

There are times however, when librarians may participate in joint sessions with teachers, psychologists and educational counselors (Gladding & Gladding, 1991). How often this relationship exists is uncertain. Baruchson-Arbib contends that most contemporary librarians seldom employ their skills as bibliotherapists with the exception of some hospital libraries. While, several hundred articles have been published on the topic of bibliotherapy, only a few researchers have dealt with its application in librarianship (Hynes & Hynes-Berry, 1986; Hynes-Berry & Doll, 1997). With such diminished interest on the part of librarians themselves, a great deal of effort would be needed to be considered as part of the functions of school librarianship (Baruchson-Arbib, 2000).

There are some concerns regarding the implementation of bibliotherapy. Jami L. Jones (2006) wrote, 'What if the principal of giving the right book to the right patron at the right time turned into a troika of wrongs; wrong book, wrong patron, wrong time?' Voicing her concerns, Fran Lehr (1981) cautions practitioners not to make off-handed book recommendations. Nevertheless, mental health specialists, librarians, to some extent nurses, and educators have kept the practice of bibliotherapy alive. Lehr (1981) advises educators to take care when addressing students' emotional issues and follow a process: ascertain the true nature of the student's needs, select the book that meets those needs, then prepare a plan that includes discussion and follow-up activities. In contrast to a treatment for symptoms of trauma, school librarian Maeve Visser Knoth (2006) would prefer to inoculate children in advance and provide children with books whose characters are involved in real-world problems. In her view, children will acquire knowledge they can apply when their families, or families they know, experience trauma.

#### **2.4 Book Selection**

Rozalski, Stewart, and Miller (2010) recommended a guide to carefully select books with appropriate themes. Among the qualifying criteria were the books' interest and reading level, presentation of characters, the context of the story, the illustrations ability to maintain the students' engagement and the effect of the author's message. These authors also acknowledged that bibliotherapy is a theoretical process based on the psychotherapeutic principals that can be used to influence students' behavior and attitudes. In structured sessions, students have been helped with obsessive-compulsive behaviors and coping skills (Rozalski et al, 2008; Haeseler 2009). Rozalski's book selection process does not appear to

engage the librarian's expertise. He acknowledged that the recommended instructional plan may be time-consuming and a challenge for teachers. Still, there is no mention of collaborative, or partnered implementation of this process.

If emotional good health via the reading of literature is the goal, then books should be selected carefully. Davis and Wilson, authors of 'Bibliotherapy and Children's Award-Winning Books' (1992) give consideration to books that have received the *Newbery* and *Caldecott Awards* the logical source for bibliotherapeutic literature. Davis and Wilson examined twenty-five *Newbery* and *Caldecott Medal* books, finding that they contained twenty-two therapeutic themes. *Newbery Medals* are awarded to books for their profound social-emotional impact on readers. These are the most prestigious awards given to children's books. *Caldecott Medal* is awarded to artists/illustrators of the most distinguished picture books for children. These medals have been awarded annually by the ALA for over eight decades (Davis & Wilson, 1992).

Leininger et al. assessed thirty-one *Newbery Medal* books from 1975–2009 for their portrayal of main or supporting characters with disabilities. Using the Rating Scale for Quality Characterizations of Individuals with Disabilities in Children's Literature they identified forty-one meeting the criteria (Leininger et al., 2010). Book selection criteria figure prominently among the concerns of other authors as well (Becnel, 2013; Dysart-Gale, 2008; Lucas & Soares, 2013; Rozalski et al., 2010). This acceptance of books as a therapeutic agent of bibliotherapy is clearly understood in Leininger et al. (2010). Yet, in EBM methodology, the focus is on quantifiable factors and restricts bibliotherapy researchers from looking directly at the texts (Dysart-Gale, 2008).

### **3. Methodology**

This paper is a content analysis of articles accessed through scholarly databases. 'Content analysis became a popular research methodology during the 1950s. Researchers used it to study mass communications. Since then it has been used in many fields of study including library and information science' (Brissett, 2008). This type of research makes a detailed and systematic examination of a particular body of materials. Its purpose is to identify patterns, themes or biases (Leedy & Ormrod, 2010).

A previous content analysis of bibliotherapy research by Piercy (1996) found that in 1970-83; only 25 percent of the research articles focused on children and 8.3 percent on young adults and in 1984-96, 21 percent focused on children and 9.5 percent on young adults. This study is similar to Piercy's in that it is a content analysis of scholarly articles related to bibliotherapy but differs in that it focuses on children and young adults and on the relationship of bibliotherapy to librarianship.

#### **3.1 Data Collection**



The search terms used to retrieve the documents in this study were 'bibliotherapy, bibliotherapy research, bibliotherapy in libraries, bibliotherapy in classrooms and schools, and bibliotherapy in counseling.'

This research was directed from a school librarian's perspective with a concern for fulfilling a school's mission to support children's emotional and social development. The documents for this analysis were accessed through academic databases, specifically *JSTOR*, *Education Resources Information Center (ERIC)*, *Education Source*, *Library & Information Science Source*, and *Library, Information Science & Technology Abstracts (LISTA)*.

### **3.2 Treatment of Data**

Articles from thirty-five scholarly publications were examined; however, not all were applicable to the research questions. Two of the scholarly publications were not applicable to any of the four questions, therefore the number of relevant documents was reduced to thirty-three (Appendix).

Notes on article content were collected and categorized into subject headings for coding. The categories were for/against usefulness of bibliotherapy, mention of librarians' contributions to bibliotherapeutic objectives, and activities/programs related to bibliotherapy. Data were compiled and displayed in tables by frequency of occurrence and as percentages rounded-up to the nearest whole number.

## **4. Results**

### **4.1. What percentage of papers in the analysis consider bibliotherapy a useful therapeutic tool?**

In order to determine which papers met the questions' criteria the data were recorded in a table by authors' name, whether bibliotherapy was deemed useful as a therapeutic tool, mention of librarians' benefit to bibliotherapy and useful applications of bibliotherapy. They were categorized in Table 1 as 'Bibliotherapy useful as a therapeutic tool' or 'Papers opposed to use of bibliotherapy'.

Generally speaking, people recognize the support self-help books can provide when facing mental health challenges. People who value reading usually have a story or two to share about how books helped them with a situation (Jones 2006). As Table 1 shows, bibliotherapy was considered useful as a therapeutic tool in thirty-two (97%) of the thirty-three papers examined.

**Table 1. Usefulness of Bibliotherapy**

	<b>Frequency</b>	<b>Percent</b>
Bibliotherapy useful as a therapeutic tool	32/33	97%
Papers opposed to use of bibliotherapy	1/33	3%

#### **4.2 What percentage of the papers were opposed to the use of bibliotherapy?**

As Table 1 shows, one paper out of the thirty-three (3%) did not consider bibliotherapy useful. There were two reasons for the opposition; the first was the unproven efficacy of bibliotherapy and the second was that practitioner's lacked expertise (Warner, 1980).

#### **4.3 What percentage of papers supporting bibliotherapy indicate librarians could be beneficial to bibliotherapeutic objectives?**

Of the thirty-two papers that supported bibliotherapy fifteen (47%) considered librarians beneficial to bibliotherapeutic objectives (Table 2). As Warner (1980) points out, there is confusion over what passes for contemporary bibliotherapy. Settings for bibliotherapy range from small group or individual counseling to classroom discussions. School librarians were regarded as bibliotherapy resource persons, collaborators with other school professionals, or were not mentioned at all. In such cases, the recommended service providers might be parents, school counselors, teachers, or school nurses.

**Table 2. Librarians and Bibliotherapy**

	<b>Frequency</b>	<b>Percent</b>
Librarians beneficial to bibliotherapeutic objectives *	15/32	47%

\*Of the papers supporting bibliotherapy

#### **4.4 What applications of bibliotherapy involving youth were identified in the articles?**

Applications of bibliotherapy and youth were diverse. Two of involved high-risk and institutionalized youth these (Tyson, 2002, 2004); others included at-risk students (Schreur, 2006), anti-bullying and inclusion to potentially isolated groups (Becnel, 2013), bibliotherapy supportive knowledge library project (Baruchson-Arbib, 2000), and training for pre-service teachers (Lutovac & Kaasila, 2011).

Bibliotherapy has been used as a strategy to help readers understand cultural diversity. 'Using Children's and Young Adult Literature in Teaching Acceptance and Understanding of Individual Differences' presented examples of bibliotherapy inclusion during librarian and teacher training (Gavigan & Kurttis, 2010). Teacher candidates reviewed literature related to children and young adults with disabilities. The goal was for these future educators to develop empathy and evaluate the portrayal of disabled characters in literature.

Some of the evaluative questions consisted of the following: *Were they pathetic, or heroic? Were the characters realistically portrayed? How are relationships with non-disabled characters described?* Gavigan and Kurtts' 2010 paper also offered classroom implementation strategies for K-12 students from proponents in the field. Students were to read or be read to and discussions led by a facilitator (Borders & Paisley, 1992). Another program advocated that teachers or librarians help the students develop background knowledge of disabilities. The strategy included guided reading for students, while attempting to identify similar challenges they may have faced in their own life. Culminating activities might consist of role-playing, writing, or interactive problem-solving games (Forgan, 2002). Thus far, there does not appear to be a widespread synergy engaging school librarians in an understanding of and tolerance for students who are different. There is a concern that many librarians may have lost interest in bibliotherapy. Perhaps this may be true in some instances; however, librarians may be subtler in their methods of *supportive knowledge* and nurturing (Gavigan & Kurtts, 2010; Gavigan, 2012).

A national survey of school libraries in the United Kingdom sought to determine how librarians could contribute to pastoral care (Shaper & Streatfield, 2012). The survey coincidentally revealed that librarians were already engaged as caregivers. The findings were published in *Pastoral Care in Education* and are summarized in descending order of frequency:

- General support and positive relationships with pupils – 'being there'
- Creating and maintaining the right environment – safe, welcoming, peaceful, accessible and different from the classroom
- Contributing to social inclusion, self-esteem and appropriate behavior
- Providing emotional support through professional engagement with individuals in a variety of ways from encouraging reading and helping with schoolwork to fostering cultural engagement and bibliotherapy. (Shaper & Streatfield, 2012, 68)

Another example of bibliotherapy use in a school setting was in the state of Michigan. A high school teacher for at-risk students implemented a bibliotherapy program in his class. The goal was to address the fundamental causes of misbehavior in students who were repeatedly suspended from school (Schreur, 2006).

The most unique application of a bibliotherapeutic process was found in Dr. Tyson's 'Hip Hot Therapy: An Exploratory Study of a Rap Music Intervention with At-Risk and Delinquent Youth' (2002). This was followed in 2004 by his rap music intervention model involving African-American and Latino Youth. He offers the reader a summary of the 'hip-hop' as a legitimate sub-culture rooted in the larger African-American culture. Tyson's proposal is a triumvirate of rap music into social work practice, music therapy and bibliotherapeutic processes. This approach incorporates the clients' immediate social environment into the

therapeutic process. Youth empowerment is a key component to this approach (Tyson, 2004).

Becnel's paper, 'Sticks, Stones, and Sneering Tones' also advocated creative programming to prevent and address the aftermath of bullying. The Ottawa Public Library partnered with local agencies creating bullying prevention resources for child care workers and parents. Other programs co-sponsored, or sponsored by public libraries include 'You belong @ your library', welcoming the lesbian, gay, bisexual and transgender (*LGBT*) members of the community to the Sacramento, CA Public Library. New York Public Library has sponsored many programs about bullying for adults and children and the Buffalo and Erie County Public Library System has led community organizations in the creation of anti-bullying campaigns. These events are consistent with several of the aforementioned goals in a bibliotherapeutic process established by Pardeck (1993, 1994; Cook, 1995).

## **5. Discussion**

The study indicates that bibliotherapy is widely viewed as useful. Additionally, the results provide insight to current and potential uses of bibliotherapy as a path toward self-help and nurturing for children and adolescents. There were several positive indicators suggesting its usefulness and sustainability.

Thirty-two (97%) papers indicated that bibliotherapy was useful. However, only fifteen of those (47%) indicated librarians could be beneficial. This disparity may be partially explained by the migration of librarians away from institutional care where they aided doctors engaged in psychotherapy treatment. Today practitioners of *developmental bibliotherapy* may include school counselors, therapists, teachers, librarians, and nurses.

A nationwide survey in the U.K. examined how well or badly school libraries were doing. The survey yielded unexpected results from a number of librarians' comments. This drew attention to an aspect of their work that had positive implications for school leaders (Shaper & Streatfield, 2012). It also held new insight into an area of librarianship some researchers believed librarians had lost interest, that is the use of bibliotherapy as supportive, or pastoral care (Doll & Doll, 1997; Baruchson-Arbib, 2000; Hynes McCarty & Hynes Berry, 1986).

One paper (3%) posed two objections to bibliotherapy. Those objections were unproven efficacy and inadequate training for those offering bibliotherapeutic services. Warner (1980) examined twenty-eight doctoral studies on bibliotherapy's treatment effectiveness and reportedly found significant inconsistencies in research methods, invalidating its claims of success. Decades after successful claims by the renowned Menninger Clinic and others like it would have their results found lacking by a different research process, EBM (Evidence-based Medicine). However, the Dysart-Gale study found the EBM methodology ill-suited to the study of literature's use in therapy. Despite the

aforementioned impediments, the last fifty years has seen bibliotherapy grow at an increasing rate into a recognized therapeutic activity aligned with the tenets of (CBT) cognitive behavioral therapy (Heath et al, 2011; Pattison & Harris, 2006).

## **6. Conclusion**

While some light has been shed on the perception of developmental bibliotherapy's research governance and usefulness, inconsistencies and limitations were brought to light as well. The exclusion of therapy texts from the EBM framework of clinical and research governance has impacted the interdisciplinary standing of developmental bibliotherapy. Dysart-Gale (2008) speculated that a useful interdisciplinary research framework might emerge from an examination of the nursing humanities' approach to theoretical and conceptual contexts. It may also be beneficial to take developmental bibliotherapy out of the medical realm. Rubin (1978) suggested that librarians view their work in developmental bibliotherapy much as an occupational therapeutic professional views theirs. He suggested that bibliotherapy be redefined with a non-therapeutic name (Baruchson-Arbib, 2000).

There should be student involvement in the design for next generation bibliotherapy. They will determine the degree to which practitioners are successful with a program model (Tyson, 2004). Librarians should be outspoken advocates about their role as disseminators of *supportive knowledge*. Finally, school districts need a comprehensive analysis of library collections to assess its quality and relevance to developmental bibliotherapy.

## **References**

- ALA/AASL. (2003). Standards for Initial Programs for School Library Media Specialists Preparation. Retrieved from [http://www.ala.org/aasl/sites/ala.org.aasl/files/contentaasleducation/schoollibrary/ala-aasl\\_slms2003.pdf](http://www.ala.org/aasl/sites/ala.org.aasl/files/contentaasleducation/schoollibrary/ala-aasl_slms2003.pdf)
- Agnes, S.M. (1946). Bibliotherapy for Socially Maladjusted Children. *Catholic Educational Review*, 44, 8 – 16.
- Allen, J. R., Allen, S. F., Latrobe, K. H., Brand, M., Pfefferbaum, B., Elledge, B., & Guffey, M. (2012). The Power of Story. *Children & Libraries: The Journal of the Association for Library Services to Children*, 10(1), 44 – 49.
- Baruchson-Arbib, S. (2000). Bibliotherapy in School Libraries: An Israeli Experiment. *School Libraries Worldwide*, 6(2), 102 – 10. Retrieved from <http://www.eric.ed.gov>
- Becnel, K. (2013). Sticks, Stones, and Sneering Tones. *Children & Libraries: The Journal of The Association for Library Service to Children*, 11(3), 10 – 15.
- Borders, S. & Paisley, P.O. (1992). Children's Literature as a Resource for Classroom Guidance. *Elementary School Guidance and Counseling*, 27(2), 131 – 140.

- Cilliers, J. (1980). *Bibliotherapy for Alcoholics and Drug Addicts*. PhD Dissertation, University of Stellenbosch, South Africa.
- Coleman, M. & Ganong, L.H. (1988). *Bibliotherapy with Stepchildren*. Springfield, Illinois: Charles Thomas.
- Cook, K.E., Earles-Vollrath, T. & Banz, J.B. (2006). Bibliotherapy. *Intervention in School & Clinic*, 42(2), 91 – 100.
- Cornett, F.C. & Cornett, C.E. (1980). *Bibliotherapy: The Right Book at the Right Time*. Bloomington, Indiana: Phi Delta Kappa Educational Foundation.
- Cronje, K.B. (1994). Bibliotherapy in Seventh-day Adventist Education: Using the Information Media for Character Development. *Institute for Christian Teaching, Education Department of Seventh-day Adventist*, 12, 49 – 66.
- Davis, K. & Wilson, T.L. (1992). Bibliotherapy and Children's Award-Winning Books. Educational Resources Information Center, *ERIC Document G024812*.
- Doll, B. & Doll, C. (1997). *Bibliotherapy with Young People: Librarians and Mental Health Professionals Working Together*. Englewood, CO: Libraries Unlimited.
- Dorland, W.A.N. (1941, 2000). *Dorland's Illustrated Medical Dictionary*. Philadelphia: Saunders.
- Dysart-Gale, D. (2008). Lost in Translation: Bibliotherapy and Evidence-Based Medicine. *Journal of Medical Humanities*, 29(1), 33 – 43.
- Forgan, J. (2002). Using Bibliotherapy to Teach Problem-Solving. *Intervention in School and Clinic*, 38(2), 75 – 82.
- Gavigan, K. (2012). Caring through Comics: Graphic Novels and Bibliotherapy for Grades 6 - 12. *Knowledge Quest*, 40(5), 78 – 80.
- Gavigan, K.W. & Kurtts, S. (2010). Using Children's and Young Adult Literature in Teaching Acceptance and Understanding of Individual Differences. *Delta Kappa Gamma Bulletin*, 77(2), 11 – 16.
- Gladding, S.T. & Gladding, C. (1991). ABCs of Bibliotherapy for School Counselors. *The School Counselor*, 39(1), 7 – 10.
- Gregory, K. E., & Vessey, J. A. (2004). Bibliotherapy: A Strategy to Help Students with Bullying. *Journal of School Nursing*, 20(3), 127 – 133.
- Haeseler, L.A. (2009). Biblio-Therapeutic Book Creations by Pre-Service Student Teachers: Helping Elementary School Children Cope. *Journal of Instructional Psychology*, 36(2), 113 – 118.
- Heath, M. A., Moulton, E., Dyches, T. T., Prater, M. A., & Brown, A. (2011). Strengthening Elementary School Bully Prevention with Bibliotherapy. *Communique*, 39(8), 12 – 14.

- Hynes, A.M. & Hynes-Berry, M. (1986). *Bibliotherapy – The Interactive Process: A Handbook*. Boulder, CO: Westview Press.
- Iaquinta, A. & Hipsky, S. (2006). Practical Bibliotherapy Strategies for the Inclusive Elementary Classroom. *Early Childhood Education Journal*, 34(3), 209 – 213.
- Jack, S.J. & Ronan, K.R. (2008). Bibliotherapy: Practice and Research. *School Psychology International*, 29(2), 161 – 182.
- Janavičienė, D. (2010). Bibliotherapy Process and Type Analysis: Review of Possibilities to Use it in the Library. *Bridges/Tiltai*, 53(4), 119 – 132.
- Jones, J.L. (2006). A Closer Look at Bibliotherapy. *Young Adult Library Services*, 5(1), 24 – 27.
- Jurkowski, O.L. (2006). Library as a Support System for Students. *Intervention in School and Clinic*, 42(2), 78 – 83.
- Katz, G. & Watt, J. (1992). Bibliotherapy: The Use of Books in Psychiatric Treatment. *Canadian Journal of Psychiatry*, 37, 173 – 178.
- Knott, M.V. (2006). What Ails Bibliotherapy? *Horn Book Magazine*, 82(3), 273 – 276
- Leedy, P.D. & Ormrod, J.E. (2010). *Practical Research Planning and Design*. Boston: Pearson.
- Lehr, F. (1981). Bibliotherapy. *Journal of Reading*, 25, 76 – 79.
- Leininger, M., Dyches, T.T., Prater, M.A., & Heath, M.A. (2010). Newbery Award Winning Books 1975 - 2009: How Do They Portray Disabilities? *Education and Training in Autism and Developmental Disabilities*, 45(4), 583 – 596.
- Lucas, C.V. & Soares, L. (2013) Bibliotherapy: A Tool to Promote Children's Psychological Well-Being. *Journal of Poetry Therapy*, 26(3), 137 – 147.
- Myracle, L. (1995). Molding the Minds of the Young: The History of Bibliotherapy as Applied to Children and Adolescents. *The Alan Review*, 22(2), 36 – 40. Retrieved from <http://scholar.lib.vt.edu/ejournals/ALAN/winter95/Myracle.html>
- Pardeck, J.T. (1993). Literature and Adoptive Children with Disabilities. *Early Child Development and Care*, 91, 33 – 39.
- Pardeck, J.T. (1994). Using Literature to Help Adolescents Cope with Problems. *Adolescence*, 29(114), 421 – 427.
- Pattison, S., & Harris, B. (2006). Adding Value to Education through Improved Mental Health: A Review of the Research Evidence on the Effectiveness of Counselling for Children and Young People. *Australian Educational Researcher*, 33(2), 97 – 121.

- Piercy, B.A. (1996). A Content Analysis and Historical Comparison of Bibliotherapy Research. *ERIC Document ED413930*.
- Rozalski, M., Stewart, A., & Miller, J. (2010). Bibliotherapy: Helping Children Cope with Life's Challenges. *Kappa Delta Pi Record*, 47(1), 33 – 37.
- Rozalski, M. E., Therrien, B., Harris, P., & Miller, J. (2008). Teaching Reading to Secondary School-Age Students with Emotional/Behavioral Disorders. In L.M. Bullock & R.A. Gable (eds.), *Seventh CCBD Mini-Library Series: Ensuring a Brighter Future for Troubled Children/Youth- Challenges and Solutions*. Reston, VA.: Council for Children with Behavior Disorders.
- Rubin, R.J. (1978). *Bibliotherapy Sourcebook*. Phoenix: Oryx.
- Russell, D. & Shrodes, C. (1950). Contributions of Research in Bibliotherapy to the Language Arts Program. *School Review*, 58, 335 – 392.
- Salup, B., & Salup, A. (1981). Bibliotherapy: An Historical Overview. *ERIC Document ED200-496*.
- Schreur, G. (2006). Using Bibliotherapy with Suspended Students: Reclaiming Children and Youth. *The Journal of Strength-Based Interventions*, 15(2), 106 – 111.
- Shaper, S. & Streatfield, D. (2012). Invisible Care? The Role of Librarians in Caring for the 'Whole Pupil' in Secondary Schools. *Pastoral Care in Education*, 30(1), 65 – 75.
- Shrodes, C. (1949). Bibliotherapy: A Theoretical and Clinical Experimental Study. PhD Dissertation, University of California.
- Stroud, J.E., Stroud, J.C., & Staley, L.M. (1999). Adopted Children in the Early Childhood Classroom. *ERIC Document ED 426-819*.
- Swart, M.H.G., ed. (1984). *School Media Center: Media Use in Schools*. Pretoria: Transvaal School Media Association.
- Tangier Smith Elementary School (1996). Mission Statement. Retrieved from <http://danaxtell.com/missions101.html>
- Tews, R.M. (1961). Bibliotherapy. *Library Trends*, 11, 1.
- Tyson, E.H. (2002). Hip Hop Therapy: An Exploratory Study of a Rap Music Intervention with At-Risk and Delinquent Youth. *Journal of Poetry Therapy*, 15(3), 131 – 144.
- Tyson, E.H. (2004) Rap Music in Social Work Practice with African-American and Latino Youth: A Conceptual Model with Practical Applications. *Journal of Human Behavior in the Social Environment*, 8(4), 1 – 21.
- Warner, L. (1980). Myth of Bibliotherapy. *School Library Journal*, 27, 107 – 111.



### **Appendix: Articles Examined in the Study**

- Allen, J. R., Allen, S. F., Latrobe, K. H., Brand, M., Pfefferbaum, B., Elledge, B., & Guffey, M. (2012). The Power of Story. *Children & Libraries: The Journal of the Association for Library Service to Children*, 10(1), 44-49.
- Baruchson-Arbib, S. (2000). Bibliotherapy in School Libraries: An Israeli Experiment. *School Libraries Worldwide*, 6(2), 102-110.
- Becnel, K. (2013). Sticks, Stones, and Sneering Tones. *Children & Libraries: The Journal of the Association for Library Service to Children*, 11(3), 10 – 15.
- Cook, K.E., Earles-Vollrath, T. & Banz, J.B. (2006). Bibliotherapy. *Intervention in School & Clinic*, 42(2), 91 – 100.
- Davis, K. & Wilson, T.L. (1992). Bibliotherapy and Children's Award-Winning Books. *Educational Resources Information Center, ERIC Document G024812*.
- Forgan, J. (2002). Using Bibliotherapy to Teach Problem-Solving. *Intervention in School and Clinic*, 38(2), 75 – 82.
- Gavigan, K. (2012). Caring through Comics: Graphic Novels and Bibliotherapy for Grades 6 - 12. *Knowledge Quest*, 40(5), 78 – 80.
- Gavigan, K.W. & Kurtts, S. (2010). Using Children's and Young Adult Literature in Teaching Acceptance and Understanding of Individual Differences. *Delta Kappa Gamma Bulletin*, 77(2), 11 – 16.
- Gladding, S.T. & Gladding, C. (1991). ABCs of Bibliotherapy for School Counselors. *The School Counselor*, 39(1), 7 – 10.
- Gregory, K. E., & Vessey, J. A. (2004). Bibliotherapy: A Strategy to Help Students with Bullying. *Journal of School Nursing*, 20(3), 127 – 133.
- Heath, M. A., Moulton, E., Dyches, T. T., Prater, M. A., & Brown, A. (2011). Strengthening Elementary School Bully Prevention with Bibliotherapy. *Communique*, 39(8), 12 – 14.
- Iaquinta, A. & Hipsky, S. (2006). Practical Bibliotherapy Strategies for the Inclusive Elementary Classroom. *Early Childhood Education Journal*, 34(3), 209 – 213.
- Ilogho, Julie E. (2011) *Bibliotherapy: An Option for Enhancing Students' Motivation for Academic Achievement in Iganmode Grammar School and Grait International College, Ota - Ogun State. Ife PsycholoGia (An International Journal of Psychology in Africa)*, 19(2), 437 – 460.
- Janavičienė, D. (2010). Bibliotherapy Process and Type Analysis: Review of Possibilities to Use it in the Library. *Bridges/Tiltai*, 53(4), 119 – 132.
- Jones, J.L. (2006). A Closer Look at Bibliotherapy. *Young Adult Library Services*, 5(1), 24 – 27.

- Jurkowski, O.L. (2006). Library as a Support System for Students. *Intervention in School and Clinic*, 42(2), 78 – 83.
- Knoth, M.V. (2006). What Ails Bibliotherapy? *Horn Book Magazine*, 82(3), 273 – 276
- Larson, J., & Hoover, J.H. (2012). Quality Books about Bullying in the Young Adult Tradition. *Reclaiming Children and Youth*, 21(1), 49 – 55.
- Lehr, F. (1981). Bibliotherapy. *Journal of Reading*, 25, 76 – 79.
- Lucas, C.V. & Soares, L. (2013) Bibliotherapy: A Tool to Promote Children's Psychological Well-Being. *Journal of Poetry Therapy*, 26(3), 137 – 147.
- Lutovac, S. & Kaasila, R. (2011). Beginning a Pre-Service Teacher's Mathematical Identity Work through Narrative Rehabilitation and Bibliotherapy. *Teaching in Higher Education*, 16(2), 225 – 236.
- Mauk, G.W. (2011). Loss-Oriented Support for Students (LOSS): Companionship the Journey from Yesterday's Sorrow to Tomorrow's Hope. *Clearing House*, 84(3), 104 – 108.
- Melnick, S. (2002). Fictional Characters in Books as Positive Role Models for Adolescent Females. *Gifted Child Today*, 25(2), 44 – 45.
- Myers, C. (2012). Bibliotherapy for Adopted Children: A Pathway for Healthier Adoptive Identity and Self-Esteem. MA Thesis, Prescott College.
- Myracle, L. (1995). Molding the Minds of the Young: The History of Bibliotherapy as Applied to Children and Adolescents. *The Alan Review*, 22(2), 36 – 40.
- Pehrsson, D., Allen, V.B., Folger, W.A., McMillen, P.S., & Lowe, I. (2007). Bibliotherapy with Preadolescents Experiencing Divorce. *Family Journal*, 15(4), 409 – 414.
- Piercy, B.A. (1996). A Content Analysis and Historical Comparison of Bibliotherapy. *ERIC Document ED413930*.
- Rozalski, M., Stewart, A., & Miller, J. (2010). Bibliotherapy: Helping Children Cope with Life's Challenges. *Kappa Delta Pi Record*, 47(1), 33 – 37.
- Schreur, G. (2006). Using Bibliotherapy with Suspended Students: Reclaiming Children and Youth. *The Journal of Strength-Based Interventions*, 15(2), 106 – 111.
- Shaper, S. & Streatfield, D. (2012). Invisible Care? The Role of Librarians in Caring for the 'Whole Pupil' in Secondary Schools. *Pastoral Care in Education*, 30(1), 65 – 75.
- Tyson, E.H. (2002). Hip Hop Therapy: An Exploratory Study of a Rap Music Intervention with At-Risk and Delinquent Youth. *Journal of Poetry Therapy*, 15(3), 131 – 144.

*Qualitative and Quantitative Methods in Libraries (QQML) Special Issue: 93*  
*School Library Research and Educational Resources:6: 75-93, 2017*

Tyson, E.H. (2004) Rap Music in Social Work Practice with African-American and Latino Youth: A Conceptual Model with Practical Applications. *Journal of Human Behavior in the Social Environment*, 8(4), 1 – 21.

Warner, L. (1980). Myth of Bibliotherapy. *School Library Journal*, 27, 107 – 111